

**EN BANC ORAL ARGUMENT HELD SEPTEMBER 27, 2016  
IN CASE NO. 15-1363  
ORAL ARGUMENT NOT SCHEDULED IN CASE NO. 17-1014**

**IN THE UNITED STATES COURT OF APPEALS  
FOR THE DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA CIRCUIT**

STATE OF WEST VIRGINIA, *et al.*,

*Petitioners,*

v.

UNITED STATES ENVIRONMENTAL  
PROTECTION AGENCY, *et al.*,

*Respondents.*

No. 15-1363 (and  
consolidated cases)

STATE OF NORTH DAKOTA,

*Petitioner,*

v.

UNITED STATES ENVIRONMENTAL  
PROTECTION AGENCY, *et al.*,

*Respondents.*

No. 17-1014 (and  
consolidated cases)

**PETITIONERS AND PETITIONER-INTERVENORS'  
REPLY IN SUPPORT OF MOTIONS TO DISMISS**

The undersigned Petitioners and Petitioner-Intervenors have moved to dismiss as moot the petitions for review in these two sets of consolidated cases.<sup>1</sup> ECF Nos. 1797267, 1798600. Respondent United States Environmental Protection Agency (“EPA” or “Agency”) supports those motions. ECF Nos. 1797703, 1798780. No Petitioner opposes the motions.

State and Public Health and Environmental Respondent-Intervenors, however, filed an opposition to the motions. ECF No. 1799095. Importantly, Respondent-Intervenors do not dispute that EPA’s final action repealing the Clean Power Plan, 84 Fed. Reg. 32,520 (July 8, 2019) (“Rule”), renders these cases moot. *See* ECF No. 1799095 at 4 (conceding “once an agency has rescinded or replaced a regulation, litigation challenging that regulation ordinarily becomes moot”). They argue instead that the motion to dismiss is premature because these cases will only become moot on the Rule’s September 6, 2019 effective date, and not before that date. *Id.*

Respondent-Intervenors are incorrect as to the timing of mootness. In the Rule, the Agency took final rulemaking actions repealing the Clean Power Plan in its entirety and replacing it with new emission guidelines. 84 Fed. Reg. at 32,521. That Rule has been final and subject to judicial review for nearly one month—indeed, some

---

<sup>1</sup> Petitioner Local Government Coalition for Renewable Energy did not join the initial motion to dismiss in Case No. 15-1363 but separately moved to dismiss its petition for review as moot on July 25, 2019. ECF No. 1799127.

Respondent-Intervenors have already filed a petition for review of the Rule.<sup>2</sup> *See Am. Lung Ass'n v. EPA*, No. 19-1140 (D.C. Cir. filed July 8, 2019). As a final rulemaking action under the Clean Air Act, the Rule (including the effective date of the Clean Power Plan repeal) cannot be rescinded, replaced, or amended without further notice-and-comment rulemaking proceedings. *See* 42 U.S.C. § 7607(d). EPA supports these motions to dismiss and has not given any indication that it intends to undertake a new rulemaking to alter the Rule. *See* ECF Nos. 1797703, 1798780. Accordingly, EPA has definitively “rescinded and replaced [the] challenged regulation,” and the Court should follow the “perfectly uncontroversial and well-settled principle of law” and find that these cases are now moot. *Akiachak Native Cmty. v. U.S. Dep’t of the Interior*, 827 F.3d 100, 113 (D.C. Cir. 2016). No one can be prejudiced in any way by the dismissal of a moot case.

Because EPA and Respondent-Intervenors agree with the undersigned Petitioners and Petitioner-Intervenors that EPA’s promulgation of the Rule renders these consolidated cases moot, the Court should grant these motions to dismiss now.

---

<sup>2</sup> The fact that some Respondent-Intervenors have already filed a petition for review of the Rule undermines their theory that these cases will not be moot until the Rule’s effective date. If that were true, then there would not yet be an Article III case or controversy providing the basis for judicial review, which would make the Clean Air Act’s judicial review provisions illogical. *See* 42 U.S.C. § 7607(b)(1) (tying timing for filing petitions for review to Federal Register publication and not to a rule’s effective date).

Dated: August 1, 2019

/s/ Allison D. Wood

F. William Brownell  
Allison D. Wood  
Henry V. Nickel  
HUNTON ANDREWS KURTH LLP  
2200 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20037  
Tel: (202) 955-1500  
bbrownell@HuntonAK.com  
awood@HuntonAK.com  
hnickel@HuntonAK.com

*Counsel for Petitioners Utility Air Regulatory  
Group and American Public Power Association*

/s/ Carroll W. McGuffey III

Carroll W. McGuffey III  
TROUTMAN SANDERS LLP  
600 Peachtree Street, N.E., Suite 3000  
Atlanta, GA 30308  
Tel: (404) 885-3000  
mack.mcguffey@troutmansanders.com

*Counsel for Petitioner National Mining  
Association*

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Lindsay S. See

Patrick Morrissey  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF WEST  
VIRGINIA  
Lindsay S. See  
Solicitor General  
*Counsel of Record*  
Thomas T. Lampman  
Assistant Solicitor General  
State Capitol Building 1, Room 26-E  
Charleston, WV 25305  
Tel: (304) 558-2021  
Fax: (304) 558-0140  
lindsay.s.see@wvago.gov  
thomas.t.lampman@wvago.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of West Virginia*

/s/ Kyle D. Hawkins

Ken Paxton  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS  
Jeffrey C. Mateer  
First Assistant Attorney General  
Kyle D. Hawkins  
Solicitor General  
*Counsel of Record*  
P.O. Box 12548  
Austin, TX 78711-2548  
Tel: (512) 936-1700  
Kyle.Hawkins@oag.texas.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Texas*

/s/ Peter D. Keisler

Peter D. Keisler  
C. Frederick Beckner III  
Ryan C. Morris  
SIDLEY AUSTIN, LLP  
1501 K Street, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20005  
Tel: (202) 736-8027  
pkeisler@sidley.com  
rbeckner@sidley.com  
rmorris@sidley.com

*Counsel for Petitioners Chamber of Commerce of the United States of America; National Association of Manufacturers; American Fuel & Petrochemical Manufacturers; National Federation of Independent Business; American Chemistry Council; American Coke and Coal Chemicals Institute; American Foundry Society; American Forest & Paper Association; American Iron & Steel Institute; American Wood Council; Brick Industry Association; Electricity Consumers Resource Council; Lignite Energy Council; National Lime Association; National Oilseed Processors Association; and Portland Cement Association*

/s/ Edmund G. LaCour Jr.

Steven T. Marshall  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF ALABAMA  
Edmund G. LaCour Jr.  
Solicitor General  
*Counsel of Record*  
501 Washington Avenue  
Montgomery, AL 36130  
Tel: (334) 353-2196  
elacour@ago.state.al.us

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Alabama*

/s/ Oramel H. Skinner

Mark Brnovich  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF ARIZONA  
Oramel H. Skinner  
Solicitor General  
*Counsel of Record*  
Keith J. Miller  
Assistant Solicitor General  
Arizona Attorney General's Office  
2005 North Central Avenue  
Phoenix, AZ 85004-1592  
Tel: (602) 542-3702  
Fax: (602) 542-8308  
o.h.skinner@azag.gov  
keith.miller@azag.gov  
SolicitorGeneral@azag.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner Arizona Corporation Commission*

/s/ Thomas A. Lorenzen

Thomas A. Lorenzen  
CROWELL & MORING LLP  
1001 Pennsylvania Ave., N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20004  
Tel: (202) 624-2500  
tlorenzen@crowell.com

*Counsel for Petitioners National Rural Electric Cooperative Association; Big Rivers Electric Corporation; Brazos Electric Power Cooperative, Inc.; Buckeye Power, Inc.; Central Montana Electric Power Cooperative; Central Power Electric Cooperative, Inc.; Corn Belt Power Cooperative; Dairyland Power Cooperative; East River Electric Power Cooperative, Inc.; Georgia Transmission Corporation; Kansas Electric Power Cooperative, Inc.; North Carolina Electric Membership Corporation; Northwest Iowa Power Cooperative; Oglethorpe Power Corporation; PowerSouth Energy Cooperative; Prairie Power, Inc.; Rushmore Electric Power Cooperative, Inc.; Seminole Electric Cooperative, Inc.; Southern Illinois Power Cooperative; Sunflower Electric Power Corporation; and Upper Missouri G. & T. Electric Cooperative, Inc.*

Rae Cronmiller  
Environmental Counsel  
NATIONAL RURAL ELECTRIC  
COOPERATIVE ASSOCIATION  
4301 Wilson Blvd.  
Arlington, VA 22203  
Tel: (703) 907-5500  
rae.cronmiller@nreca.coop

*Counsel for Petitioner National Rural Electric Cooperative Association*

/s/ Nicholas J. Bronni

Leslie Rutledge  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF ARKANSAS  
Nicholas J. Bronni  
Solicitor General  
*Counsel of Record*  
323 Center Street, Suite 200  
Little Rock, AR 72201  
Tel: (501) 682-6302  
nicholas.bronni@arkansasag.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Arkansas*

/s/ Daniel W. Bell

Ashley Moody  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF FLORIDA  
Amit Agarwal  
Solicitor General  
Daniel W. Bell  
*Counsel of Record*  
Deputy Solicitor General  
Office of the Attorney General  
PL-01, The Capitol  
Tallahassee, FL 32399-1050  
Tel: (850) 414-3818  
Fax: (850) 410-2672  
Amit.Agarwal@myfloridalegal.com  
Daniel.Bell@myfloridalegal.com

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Florida*

/s/ Eric L. Hiser

Eric L. Hiser  
JORDEN HISER & JOY, PLC  
5080 N. 40<sup>th</sup> Street, Suite 245  
Phoenix, AZ 85018  
Tel: (480) 505-3927  
ehiser@JHJLawyers.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Arizona Electric Power  
Cooperative, Inc.*

/s/ Brian A. Prestwood

Brian A. Prestwood  
Senior Corporate and Compliance  
Counsel  
ASSOCIATED ELECTRIC COOPERATIVE,  
INC.  
2814 S. Golden, P.O. Box 754  
Springfield, MO 65801  
Tel: (417) 885-9273  
bprestwood@aeci.org

*Counsel for Petitioner Associated Electric  
Cooperative, Inc.*

/s/ David Crabtree

David Crabtree  
Vice President, General Counsel  
DESERET GENERATION & TRANSMISSION  
CO-OPERATIVE  
10714 South Jordan Gateway  
South Jordan, UT 84095  
Tel: (801) 619-9500  
Crabtree@deseretpower.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Deseret Generation &  
Transmission Co-operative*

/s/ Andrew A. Pinson

Christopher M. Carr  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF GEORGIA  
Andrew A. Pinson  
Deputy Solicitor General  
*Counsel of Record*  
Office of the Attorney General  
40 Capitol Square S.W.  
Atlanta, GA 30334-1300  
Tel: (404) 651-9453  
Fax: (404) 657-8773  
apinson@law.ga.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Georgia*

/s/ Thomas M. Fisher

Curtis T. Hill, Jr.  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF INDIANA  
Thomas M. Fisher  
Solicitor General  
*Counsel of Record*  
Office of the Attorney General  
Indiana Government Ctr. South  
Fifth Floor  
302 West Washington Street  
Indianapolis, IN 46204-2770  
Tel: (317) 232-6255  
Fax: (317) 232-7979  
tom.fisher@atg.in.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Indiana*

/s/ John M. Holloway III

John M. Holloway III  
WILLIAMS MULLEN  
1666 K Street, N.W., Suite 1200  
Washington, D.C. 20006  
Tel: (202) 293-8127  
Fax: (202) 293-5939  
jholloway@williamsmullen.com

*Counsel for Petitioners East Kentucky Power  
Cooperative, Inc.; Hoosier Energy Rural Electric  
Cooperative, Inc.; Minnkota Power Cooperative,  
Inc.; and South Mississippi Electric Power  
Association*

Joshua L. Belcher  
EVERSHEDS SUTHERLAND (US) LLP  
1101 Fannin Street, Suite 3700  
Houston, TX 77002  
Tel: (713) 470-6118  
Fax: (713) 470-6118  
joshuabelcher@eversheds-sutherland.com

*Counsel for Petitioner East Kentucky Power  
Cooperative, Inc.*

/s/ Patrick Burchette

Patrick Burchette  
HOLLAND & KNIGHT LLP  
800 17<sup>th</sup> Street, N.W., Suite 1100  
Washington, D.C. 20006  
Tel: (202) 469-5102  
Patrick.Burchette@hkllaw.com

*Counsel for Petitioners East Texas Electric  
Cooperative, Inc.; Northeast Texas Electric  
Cooperative, Inc.; Sam Rayburn G&T Electric  
Cooperative, Inc.; and Tex-La Electric  
Cooperative of Texas, Inc.*

/s/ Jeffrey A. Chanay

Derek Schmidt  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF KANSAS  
Jeffrey A. Chanay  
Chief Deputy Attorney General  
*Counsel of Record*  
120 S.W. 10th Avenue, 3rd Floor  
Topeka, KS 66612  
Tel: (785) 368-8435  
Fax: (785) 291-3767  
jeff.chanay@ag.ks.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Kansas*

/s/ Sarah Ellen Adkins

Andy Beshear  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF KENTUCKY  
Sarah Ellen Adkins  
Assistant Attorneys General  
700 Capital Avenue  
Suite 118  
Frankfort, KY 40601  
Tel: (502) 696-5611  
sarah.adkins@ky.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner Commonwealth of  
Kentucky*



/s/ Christopher L. Bell  
Christopher L. Bell  
GREENBERG TRAUIG LLP  
1000 Louisiana Street, Suite 1700  
Houston, TX 77002  
Tel: (713) 374-3556  
bellc@gtlaw.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Golden Spread Electrical  
Cooperative, Inc.*

/s/ Michael J. Nasi  
Michael J. Nasi  
JACKSON WALKER L.L.P.  
100 Congress Avenue, Suite 1100  
Austin, TX 78701  
Tel: (512) 236-2000  
Fax: (512) 236-2002  
mnasi@jw.com

*Counsel for Petitioners San Miguel Electric  
Cooperative, Inc., South Texas Electric  
Cooperative, Inc.*

/s/ Randolph G. Holt  
Randolph G. Holt  
Jeremy L. Fetty  
PARR RICHEY OBREMSKEY FRANSEN &  
PATTERSON LLP  
Wabash Valley Power Association, Inc.  
722 N. High School Road  
P.O. Box 24700  
Indianapolis, IN 46224  
Tel: (317) 481-2815  
R\_holt@wvpa.com  
jfetty@parrlaw.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Wabash Valley Power  
Association, Inc.*

/s/ Elizabeth B. Murrill  
Jeff Landry  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF LOUISIANA  
Elizabeth B. Murrill  
*Counsel of Record*  
Harry J. Vorhoff  
Assistant Attorneys General  
Office of the Louisiana Attorney General  
Louisiana Department of Justice  
1885 N. Third Street  
Baton Rouge, LA 70802  
Tel: (225) 326-6085  
Fax: (225) 326-6099  
murrille@ag.louisiana.gov  
vorhoffh@ag.louisiana.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Louisiana*

/s/ Herman Robinson  
Herman Robinson  
Executive Counsel  
Courtney J. Burdette  
Charlotte M. Goudeau  
LOUISIANA DEPARTMENT OF  
ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY  
Legal Division  
P.O. Box 4302  
Baton Rouge, LA 70821-4302  
Tel: (225) 219-3985  
Fax: (225) 219-4068  
courtney.burdette@la.gov  
charlotte.goudeau@la.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Louisiana  
Department of Environmental Quality*

/s/ Megan H. Berge  
Megan H. Berge  
Evan A. Young  
Emily J. Wilson  
BAKER BOTTS L.L.P.  
1299 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20004  
Tel: (202) 639-7700  
megan.berge@bakerbotts.com  
evan.young@bakerbotts.com  
emily.wilson@bakerbotts.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Western Farmers Electric  
Cooperative*

/s/ Steven C. Kohl  
Steven C. Kohl  
Gaetan Gerville-Reache  
WARNER NORCROSS & JUDD LLP  
2000 Town Center, Suite 2700  
Southfield, MI 48075-1318  
Tel: (248) 784-5000  
skohl@wnj.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Wolverine Power Supply  
Cooperative, Inc.*

/s/ Lesley Foxhall Pietras  
Lesley Foxhall Pietras  
LISKOW & LEWIS, P.L.C.  
701 Poydras Street, Suite 5000  
New Orleans, LA 70139  
Tel: (504) 556-4125  
Fax: (504) 556-4108  
lfpietras@liskow.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Louisiana Public Service  
Commission*

/s/ Harold E. Pizzetta, III  
Jim Hood  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF THE STATE  
OF  
MISSISSIPPI  
Harold E. Pizzetta  
Assistant Attorney General  
Civil Litigation Division  
Office of the Attorney General  
Post Office Box 220  
Jackson, MS 39205  
Tel: (601) 359-3816  
Fax: (601) 359-2003  
hpizz@ago.state.ms.us

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Mississippi*

/s/ Donna J. Hodges  
Donna J. Hodges  
Senior Counsel  
MISSISSIPPI DEPARTMENT OF  
ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY  
P.O. Box 2261  
Jackson, MS 39225-2261  
Tel: (601) 961-5369  
Fax: (601) 961-5349  
dhodges@deq.state.ms.us

*Counsel for Petitioner Mississippi Department  
of Environmental Quality*

/s/ Christina F. Gomez

Christina F. Gomez  
Jill H. Van Noord  
HOLLAND & HART LLP  
555 Seventeenth Street, Suite 3200  
Denver, CO 80202  
Tel: (303) 295-8000  
Fax: (303) 295-8261  
cgomez@hollandhart.com  
jhvan Noord@hollandhart.com

Patrick R. Day  
HOLLAND & HART LLP  
2515 Warren Avenue, Suite 450  
Cheyenne, WY 82001  
Tel: (307) 778-4200  
Fax: (307) 778-8175  
pday@hollandhart.com

Emily C. Schilling  
HOLLAND & HART LLP  
222 South Main Street, Suite 2200  
Salt Lake City, UT 84101  
Tel: (801) 799-5800  
Fax: (801) 799-5700  
ecschilling@hollandhart.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Basin Electric Power  
Cooperative*

/s/ Todd E. Palmer

Todd E. Palmer  
William D. Booth  
John A. Sheehan  
MICHAEL, BEST & FRIEDRICH LLP  
601 Pennsylvania Ave., N.W., Suite 700  
Washington, D.C. 20004-2601  
Tel: (202) 747-9560  
Fax: (202) 347-1819  
tepalmer@michaelbest.com  
wdbooth@michaelbest.com  
jasheehan@michaelbest.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Mississippi Public Service  
Commission*

/s/ D. John Sauer

Eric S. Schmitt  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF MISSOURI  
D. John Sauer  
Solicitor General  
*Counsel of Record*  
P.O. Box 899  
207 W. High Street  
Jefferson City, MO 65102  
Tel: (573) 751-1800  
Fax: (573) 751-0774  
john.sauer@ago.mo.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Missouri*

/s/ Stacey Turner

Stacey Turner  
SOUTHERN COMPANY SERVICES, INC.  
600 18th Street North  
BIN 14N-8195  
Birmingham, AL 35203  
Tel: (205) 257-2823  
staturner@southernco.com

*Counsel for Petitioners Alabama Power Company, Georgia Power Company, and Mississippi Power Company*

/s/ C. Grady Moore, III

C. Grady Moore, III  
BALCH & BINGHAM LLP  
1901 Sixth Avenue North, Suite 1500  
Birmingham, AL 35303-4642  
Tel: (205) 251-8100  
Fax: (205) 488-5704  
gmoore@balch.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Alabama Power Company*

/s/ Margaret Claiborne Campbell

Margaret Claiborne Campbell  
Angela J. Levin  
TROUTMAN SANDERS LLP  
600 Peachtree Street, NE, Suite 5200  
Atlanta, GA 30308-2216  
Tel: (404) 885-3000  
margaret.campbell@troutmansanders.com  
angela.levin@troutmansanders.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Georgia Power Company*

/s/ Matthew T. Cochenour

Timothy C. Fox  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF MONTANA  
Matthew T. Cochenour  
Deputy Solicitor General  
*Counsel of Record*  
215 North Sanders  
Helena, MT 59620-1401  
Tel: (406) 444-2026  
mcochenour2@mt.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Montana*

/s/ Justin D. Lavene

Douglas J. Peterson  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF NEBRASKA  
Dave Bydlaek  
Chief Deputy Attorney General  
Justin D. Lavene  
Assistant Attorney General  
*Counsel of Record*  
2115 State Capitol  
Lincoln, NE 68509  
Tel: (402) 471-2834  
justin.lavene@nebraska.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Nebraska*

/s/ M. Brant Pettis

M. Brant Pettis  
BALCH & BINGHAM LLP  
1310 Twenty Fifth Avenue  
Gulfport, MS 39501-1931  
Tel: (228) 214-0426  
Fax: (228) 864-8221  
bpettis@balch.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Mississippi Power  
Company*

/s/ James S. Alves

James S. Alves  
2110 Trescott Drive  
Tallahassee, FL 32308  
Tel: (850) 566-7607  
jim.s.alves@outlook.com

*Counsel for Petitioner CO<sub>2</sub> Task Force of the  
Florida Electric Power Coordinating Group, Inc.*

/s/ Megan H. Berge

Megan H. Berge  
Evan A. Young  
Emily J. Wilson  
BAKER BOTTS L.L.P.  
1299 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20004  
Tel: (202) 639-7700  
megan.berge@bakerbotts.com  
evan.young@bakerbotts.com  
emily.wilson@bakerbotts.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Entergy Corporation*

/s/ Paul M. Seby

Wayne Stenehjem  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF NORTH  
DAKOTA  
Margaret Olson  
Assistant Attorney General  
NORTH DAKOTA ATTORNEY GENERAL'S  
OFFICE  
600 E. Boulevard Avenue #125  
Bismarck, ND 58505  
Tel: (701) 328-3640  
wstenehjem@nd.gov  
maiolson@nd.gov

Paul M. Seby  
Jerry Stouck  
Special Assistant Attorneys General  
State of North Dakota  
GREENBERG TRAURIG, LLP  
1200 17th Street, Suite 2400  
Denver, CO 80202  
Tel: (303) 572-6500  
Fax: (303) 572-6540  
sebyp@gtlaw.com  
stouckj@gtlaw.com

*Counsel for Petitioner State of North Dakota*

/s/ Paul J. Zidlicky

Paul J. Zidlicky  
SIDLEY AUSTIN, LLP  
1501 K Street, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20005  
Tel: (202) 736-8000  
pzidlicky@sidley.com

*Counsel for Petitioners GenOn Mid-Atlantic, LLC; Indian River Power LLC; Louisiana Generating LLC; Midwest Generation, LLC; NRG Chalk Point LLC (n/k/a GenOn Chalk Point, LLC); NRG Power Midwest LP (n/k/a GenOn Power Midwest, LP); NRG Rema LLC (n/k/a GenOn REMA, LLC); NRG Texas Power LLC; NRG Wholesale Generation LP (n/k/a GenOn Wholesale Generation, LP); and Vienna Power LLC*

/s/ David M. Flannery

David M. Flannery  
Kathy G. Beckett  
Edward L. Kropp  
STEPTOE & JOHNSON, PLLC  
707 Virginia Street East  
Charleston, WV 25326  
Tel: (304) 353-8000  
dave.flannery@steptoe-johnson.com  
kathy.beckett@steptoe-johnson.com  
skipp.kropp@steptoe-johnson.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Indiana Utility Group*

/s/ Benjamin M. Flowers

Dave Yost  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF OHIO  
Benjamin M. Flowers  
State Solicitor  
*Counsel of Record*  
Cameron F. Simmons  
30 E. Broad Street, 17th Floor  
Columbus, OH 43215  
Tel: (614) 466-8980  
bflowers@ohioattorneygeneral.gov  
cameron.simmons@ohioattorneygeneral.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Ohio*

/s/ F. William Brownell

F. William Brownell  
Eric J. Murdock  
HUNTON ANDREWS KURTH LLP  
2200 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20037  
Tel: (202) 955-1500  
bbrownell@HuntonAK.com  
emurdock@HuntonAK.com

Nash E. Long III  
HUNTON ANDREWS KURTH LLP  
Bank of America Plaza, Suite 3500  
101 South Tryon Street  
Charlotte, NC 28280  
Tel: (704) 378-4700  
nlong@HuntonAK.com

*Counsel for Petitioner LG&E and KU Energy  
LLC*

/s/ David B. Rivkin, Jr.

Mike Hunter  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF OKLAHOMA  
P. Clayton Eubanks  
Deputy Solicitor General  
Oklahoma Office of the Attorney  
General  
313 NE 21st Street  
Oklahoma City, OK 73105  
Tel: (405) 522-8992  
Fax: (405) 522-0608  
clayton.eubanks@oag.ok.gov

David B. Rivkin, Jr.  
*Counsel of Record*  
Mark W. DeLaquil  
Andrew M. Grossman  
BAKER & HOSTETLER LLP  
Washington Square, Suite 1100  
1050 Connecticut Ave., N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20036  
Tel: (202) 861-1731  
Fax: (202) 861-1783  
drivkin@bakerlaw.com

*Counsel for Petitioners State of Oklahoma and  
Oklahoma Department of Environmental  
Quality*

/s/ P. Stephen Gidiere III

P. Stephen Gidiere III  
Thomas L. Casey III  
Julia B. Barber  
BALCH & BINGHAM LLP  
1901 6th Ave. N., Suite 1500  
Birmingham, AL 35203  
Tel: (205) 251-8100  
sgidiere@balch.com

Stephanie Z. Moore  
Executive Vice President & General  
Counsel  
VISTRA ENERGY CORP.  
6555 Sierra Drive  
Irving, Texas 75039

Daniel J. Kelly  
Vice President & Associate General  
Counsel  
VISTRA ENERGY CORP.  
6555 Sierra Drive  
Irving, Texas 75039

*Counsel for Petitioners Luminant Generation  
Company LLC; Oak Grove Management  
Company LLC; Big Brown Power Company  
LLC; Sandow Power Company LLC; Big  
Brown Lignite Company LLC; Luminant  
Mining Company LLC; and Luminant Big  
Brown Mining Company LLC*

/s/ James Emory Smith, Jr.

Alan Wilson  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF SOUTH  
CAROLINA  
Robert D. Cook  
Solicitor General  
James Emory Smith, Jr.  
Deputy Solicitor General  
*Counsel of Record*  
P.O. Box 11549  
Columbia, SC 29211  
Tel: (803) 734-3680  
Fax: (803) 734-3677  
esmith@scag.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of South Carolina*

/s/ Steven R. Blair

Jason R. Ravensborg  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF SOUTH  
DAKOTA  
Steven R. Blair  
Assistant Attorney General  
*Counsel of Record*  
1302 E. Highway 14, Suite 1  
Pierre, SD 57501  
Tel: (605) 773-3215  
steven.blair@state.sd.us

*Counsel for Petitioner State of South Dakota*



/s/ Ronald J. Tenpas  
Ronald J. Tenpas  
VINSON & ELKINS LLP  
2200 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20037  
Tel: (202) 639-6791  
rtenpas@velaw.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Minnesota Power (an  
operating division of ALLETE, Inc.)*

/s/ Allison D. Wood  
Allison D. Wood  
Andrew D. Knudsen  
HUNTON ANDREWS KURTH LLP  
2200 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20037  
Tel: (202) 955-1500  
awood@HuntonAK.com  
aknudsen@HuntonAK.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Montana-Dakota Utilities  
Co., a Division of MDU Resources Group, Inc.*

/s/ Tyler R. Green  
Sean Reyes  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF UTAH  
Tyler R. Green  
Solicitor General  
*Counsel of Record*  
Parker Douglas  
Federal Solicitor  
Utah State Capitol Complex  
350 North State Street, Suite 230  
Salt Lake City, UT 84114-2320  
pdouglas@agutah.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Utah*

/s/ Megan H. Berge

Megan H. Berge  
Evan A. Young  
Emily J. Wilson  
BAKER BOTTS L.L.P.  
1299 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20004  
Tel: (202) 639-7700  
megan.berge@bakerbotts.com  
evan.young@bakerbotts.com  
emily.wilson@bakerbotts.com

*Counsel for Petitioner NorthWestern  
Corporation d/b/a NorthWestern Energy*

/s/ Joshua R. More

Joshua R. More  
Jane E. Montgomery  
Amy Antonioli  
SCHIFF HARDIN LLP  
233 South Wacker Drive  
Suite 7100  
Chicago, IL 60606  
Tel: (312) 258-5500  
jmore@schiffhardin.com  
jmontgomery@schiffhardin.com  
aantonioli@schiffhardin.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Prairie State Generating  
Company, LLC*

/s/ Allison D. Wood

Allison D. Wood  
Andrew D. Knudsen  
HUNTON ANDREWS KURTH LLP  
2200 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20037  
Tel: (202) 955-1500  
awood@HuntonAK.com  
aknudsen@HuntonAK.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Tri-State Generation and  
Transmission Association, Inc.*

/s/ James Kaste

Bridget Hill  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF WYOMING  
James Kaste  
Deputy Attorney General  
*Counsel of Record*  
Erik Petersen  
Wyoming Attorney General's Office  
2320 Capitol Avenue  
Cheyenne, WY 82002  
Tel: (307) 777-6946  
Fax: (307) 777-3542  
james.kaste@wyo.gov

*Counsel for Petitioner State of Wyoming*

/s/ Dennis Lane

Dennis Lane  
STINSON LLP  
1775 Pennsylvania Ave., N.W., Suite 800  
Washington, D.C. 20006  
Tel: (202) 785-9100  
Fax: (202) 785-9163  
dennis.lane@stinson.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Kansas City Board of  
Public Utilities – Unified Government of  
Wyandotte County/ Kansas City, Kansas*

/s/ Megan H. Berge

Megan H. Berge

Evan A. Young

Emily J. Wilson

BAKER BOTTS L.L.P.

1299 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.

Washington, D.C. 20004

Tel: (202) 639-7700

megan.berge@bakerbotts.com

evan.young@bakerbotts.com

emily.wilson@bakerbotts.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Westar Energy, Inc.*

/s/ Jeffrey R. Holmstead

Jeffrey R. Holmstead

Brittany M. Pemberton

BRACEWELL LLP

2001 M Street, N.W., Suite 900

Washington, D.C. 20036

Tel: (202) 828-5852

Fax: (202) 857-4812

jeff.holmstead@bracewelllaw.com

*Counsel for Petitioner American Coalition for  
Clean Coal Electricity*

/s/ John D. Lazzaretti

John D. Lazzaretti

SQUIRE PATTON BOGGS (US) LLP

4900 Key Tower

127 Public Square

Cleveland, OH 44114

Tel: (216) 479-8350

john.lazzaretti@squirepb.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Murray Energy  
Corporation*

/s/ Andrew C. Emrich  
Andrew C. Emrich  
HOLLAND & HART LLP  
6380 South Fiddlers Green Circle  
Suite 500  
Greenwood Village, CO 80111  
Tel: (303) 290-1621  
Fax: (866) 711-8046  
acemrich@hollandhart.com

Emily C. Schilling  
HOLLAND & HART LLP  
222 South Main Street, Suite 2200  
Salt Lake City, UT 84101  
Tel: (801) 799-5753  
Fax: (202) 747-6574  
ecschilling@hollandhart.com

*Counsel for Petitioners Newmont Nevada  
Energy Investment, LLC and Newmont USA  
Limited*

/s/ Charles T. Wehland  
Charles T. Wehland  
JONES DAY  
77 West Wacker Drive, Suite 3500  
Chicago, IL 60601-1692  
Tel: (312) 782-3939  
Fax: (312) 782-8585  
ctwehland@jonesday.com

*Counsel for Petitioners The North American  
Coal Corporation; The Coteau Properties  
Company; Coyote Creek Mining Company,  
L.L.C.; The Falkirk Mining Company;  
Mississippi Lignite Mining Company; North  
American Coal Royalty Company; NODAK  
Energy Services, LLC; Otter Creek Mining  
Company, LLC; and The Sabine Mining  
Company*

/s/ Robert G. McLusky

Robert G. McLusky  
JACKSON KELLY, PLLC  
1600 Laidley Tower  
P.O. Box 553  
Charleston, WV 25322  
Tel: (304) 340-1000  
rmclusky@jacksonkelly.com

*Counsel for Petitioner West Virginia Coal  
Association*

/s/ Eugene M. Trisko

Eugene M. Trisko  
LAW OFFICES OF EUGENE M. TRISKO  
P.O. Box 596  
Berkeley Springs, WV 25411  
Tel: (301) 639-5238  
emtrisko7@gmail.com

*Counsel for Petitioner International Brotherhood  
of Boilermakers, Iron Ship Builders,  
Blacksmiths, Forgers & Helpers*

/s/ Eugene M. Trisko

Eugene M. Trisko  
LAW OFFICES OF EUGENE M. TRISKO  
P.O. Box 596  
Berkeley Springs, WV 25411  
Tel: (301) 639-5238  
emtrisko7@gmail.com

*Counsel for Petitioner International Brotherhood  
of Electrical Workers, AFL-CIO*

/s/ Eugene M. Trisko  
Eugene M. Trisko  
LAW OFFICES OF EUGENE M. TRISKO  
P.O. Box 596  
Berkeley Springs, WV 25411  
Tel: (301) 639-5238  
emtrisko7@gmail.com

Grant F. Crandall  
General Counsel (Ret.)  
UNITED MINE WORKERS OF AMERICA  
18354 Quantico Gateway Drive  
Triangle, VA 22172  
Tel: (703) 291-2429  
gcrandall@umwa.org

Arthur Traynor, III  
Counsel  
UNITED MINE WORKERS OF AMERICA  
18354 Quantico Gateway Drive  
Triangle, VA 22172  
Tel: (571) 383-4013  
atraynor@umwa.org

*Counsel for Petitioner United Mine Workers of  
America*

/s/ Steven P. Lehotsky  
Steven P. Lehotsky  
Michael B. Schon  
U.S. CHAMBER LITIGATION CENTER  
1615 H Street, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20062  
Tel: (202) 463-5337  
slehotsky@uschamber.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Chamber of Commerce of  
the United States of America*

/s/ Peter Tolsdorf

Peter Tolsdorf  
MANUFACTURERS' CENTER FOR LEGAL  
ACTION  
733 10th Street, N.W., Suite 700  
Washington, D.C. 20001  
Tel: (202) 637-3000  
ptolsdorf@nam.org

*Counsel for Petitioner National Association of  
Manufacturers*

/s/ Richard S. Moskowitz

Richard S. Moskowitz  
AMERICAN FUEL & PETROCHEMICAL  
MANUFACTURERS  
1667 K Street, N.W., Suite 700  
Washington, D.C. 20006  
Tel: (202) 457-0480  
rmoskowitz@afpm.org

*Counsel for Petitioner American Fuel &  
Petrochemical Manufacturers*

/s/ Karen R. Harned

Karen R. Harned  
Executive Director  
Elizabeth A. Milito  
NATIONAL FEDERATION OF  
INDEPENDENT BUSINESS  
SMALL BUSINESS LEGAL CENTER  
1201 F Street, N.W., Suite 200  
Washington, D.C. 20004  
Tel: (202) 314-2061  
karen.harned@nfib.org  
elizabeth.milito@nfib.org

*Counsel for Petitioner National Federation of  
Independent Business*

/s/ Megan H. Berge

Megan H. Berge  
Evan A. Young  
Emily J. Wilson  
BAKER BOTTS L.L.P.  
1299 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20004  
Tel: (202) 639-7700  
megan.berge@bakerbotts.com  
evan.young@bakerbotts.com  
emily.wilson@bakerbotts.com

*Counsel for Petitioner National Association of  
Home Builders*

/s/ Kathryn D. Kirmayer

Kathryn D. Kirmayer  
General Counsel  
Alice Koethe  
Assistant General Counsel  
ASSOCIATION OF AMERICAN RAILROADS  
425 3rd Street, S.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20024  
Tel: (202) 639-2100  
kkirmayer@aar.org  
akoethe@aar.org

*Counsel for Petitioner Association of American  
Railroads*



/s/ Chaim Mandelbaum  
Chaim Mandelbaum  
Litigation Manager  
FREE MARKET ENVIRONMENTAL LAW  
CLINIC  
726 N. Nelson Street, Suite 9  
Arlington, VA 22203  
Tel: (703) 577-9973  
chaim12@gmail.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Energy and Environment  
Legal Institute*

/s/ Catherine E. Stetson  
Catherine E. Stetson  
Erin Chapman  
HOGAN LOVELLS US LLP  
555 Thirteenth Street, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20004-1109  
Tel: (202) 637-5600  
Fax: (202) 637-5910  
cate.stetson@hoganlovells.com  
erin.chapman@hoganlovells.com

*Counsel for Petitioner Denbury Onshore, LLC*

/s/ Adam R.F. Gustafson

C. Boyden Gray

Adam R.F. Gustafson

*Counsel of Record*

James R. Conde

BOYDEN GRAY & ASSOCIATES, PLLC

801 17th Street, N.W., Suite 350

Washington, D.C. 20006

Tel: (202) 955-0620

gustafson@boydengrayassociates.com

*Counsel for Petitioners Competitive Enterprise  
Institute; Buckeye Institute for Public Policy  
Solutions; Independence Institute; Rio Grande  
Foundation; Sutherland Institute; Klaus J.  
Christoph; Samuel R. Damewood; Catherine C.  
Dellin; Joseph W. Luquire; Lisa R. Markham;  
Patrick T. Peterson; and Kristi Rosenquist*

Sam Kazman

COMPETITIVE ENTERPRISE INSTITUTE

1310 L Street, N.W., 7th Floor

Washington, D.C. 20005

Tel: (202) 331-1010

Sam.Kazman@cei.org

*Counsel for Petitioner Competitive Enterprise  
Institute*

Robert Alt

BUCKEYE INSTITUTE FOR PUBLIC POLICY

SOLUTIONS

88 E. Broad Street, Suite 1300

Columbus, OH 43215

Tel: (614) 224-4422

robert@buckeyeinstitute.org

*Counsel for Petitioner Buckeye Institute for  
Public Policy Solutions*

/s/ Tristan L. Duncan

Tristan L. Duncan  
SHOOK HARDY & BACON L.L.P.  
2555 Grand Boulevard  
Kansas City, MO 64018  
Tel: (816) 474-6550  
Fax: (816) 421-5547  
tlduncan@shb.com

*Counsel for Petitioner-Intervenors Dixon Bros.,  
Inc., Nelson Brothers, Inc., Wesco International,  
Inc., Norfolk Southern Corp., Joy Global, Inc.,  
and Gulf Coast Lignite Coalition*

/s/ Jonathan S. Massey

Jonathan S. Massey  
MASSEY & GAIL, LLP  
1325 G Street, N.W., Suite 500  
Washington, D.C. 20005  
Tel: (202) 652-4511  
Fax: (312) 379-0467  
jmassey@masseygail.com

Shay Dvoretzky  
Charles T. Wehland  
JONES DAY  
51 Louisiana Avenue, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20001  
Tel: (202) 879-3939  
Fax: (202) 879-1600  
sdvoretzky@jonesday.com  
ctwehland@jonesday.com

*Counsel for Petitioner and Petitioner-Intervenor  
Peabody Energy Corporation*

/s/ Michael J. Nasi

Michael Nasi

JACKSON WALKER L.L.P.

100 Congress Avenue, Suite 1100

Austin, TX 78701

Tel: (512) 236-2000

Fax: (512) 236-2002

mnasi@jw.com

Douglas Bryan Hughes

LAW OFFICES OF D. BRYAN HUGHES

701 N. Pacific Street

Mineola, TX 75773

Tel: (903) 569-8880

bryan@hughesfirm.com

*Counsel for Petitioner-Intervenor Gulf Coast  
Lignite Coalition*

**CERTIFICATE OF COMPLIANCE**

Pursuant to Rules 27(d)(2) and 32(g) of the Federal Rules of Appellate Procedure and Circuit Rules 32(a)(1) and 32(e)(1), I hereby certify that the foregoing document contains 506 words, as counted by a word processing system that includes headings, footnotes, quotations, and citations in the count, and therefore is within the word limit set by the Court.

Dated: August 1, 2019

/s/ Allison D. Wood

Allison D. Wood

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that, on this 1<sup>st</sup> day of August 2019, a copy of the foregoing document was served electronically through the Court's CM/ECF system on all ECF-registered counsel.

/s/ Allison D. Wood

Allison D. Wood